



This work is licensed under a  
[Creative Commons Attribution 4.0  
International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)



## AL DALILI

Bi-Annual, Multilingual (Arabic, Balochi, Birahvi, English, Pashto, Persian, Urdu)

ISSN: 2788-4627 (Print), ISSN: 2788-4635 (online)

Project of **RAHATULQULOOB RESEARCH ACADEMY**,

Jamiat road, Khiljiabad, near Pak-Turk School, link Spini road, Quetta, Pakistan.

Website: [www.aldalili.com](http://www.aldalili.com)

Approved by Higher Education Commission Pakistan

Indexing: » IRI (AIOU), Tahqeeqat, Euro pub, MIAR.

## TOPIC

**Spelling Issues of Brahui Language; Causes and Suggestions**

## AUTHORS

1. Dr. Liaquat Ali Sani, Associate Professor, Brahui Department, University of Balochistan, Quetta, Pakistan. Email: [liaqatsani81@gmail.com](mailto:liaqatsani81@gmail.com)
2. Dr. Yousaf Ali Rodeni, Assistant professor, Pakistan Study center, UOB, Quetta, Pakistan. Email: [yousufrodeni@yahoo.com](mailto:yousufrodeni@yahoo.com)
3. Muneer Ahmed Hanfi, Lecturer, Brahui Department, UOB, Quetta Pakistan

**How to Cite:** Dr. Liaquat Ali Sani, Dr. Yousaf Ali Rodeni, & Muneer Ahmed Hanfi. (2022). ENGLISH: Spelling Issues of Brahui Language; Causes and Suggestions. *Al-Dalili*, 4(1), 01–11. Retrieved from <https://aldalili.com/index.php/dalili/article/view/73>

URL: <https://aldalili.com/index.php/dalili/article/view/73>

Vol. 4, No.1 || July–December 2022 || English: Page. 01-11

Published online: 06-08-2022

QR. Code



## Spelling Issues of Brahui Language; Causes and Suggestions

<sup>1</sup> Liaquat Ali Sani, <sup>2</sup> Yousaf Ali Rodeni, <sup>3</sup> Muneer Ahmed Hanfi

### ABSTRACT:

Brahui language with five long and three short vowels includes with three diphthongs. generally known as vowel-oriented language and now is being written in Nastaaliq script. Brahui does not have his own script yet. on the other hand, used to be written in four different scripts in different periods. The main problem with Brahui spelling and calligraphy is that the Brahui language did not create its own form of writing. There fore, the voice of  $\text{ٲ}$  (e),  $\text{آ}$  (aa),  $\text{ا}$  (a),  $\text{و}$  (o)  $\text{وو}$  (uu) are not notified in Brahui's current writing shape. The purpose of this research paper is to highlight the problems of spelling in Brahui writing system and unwritten vowels have been identified. Further more, discussed the causes of some phonemes which are reflects in speech but are missing in writing. Which results those four different symbols are used to denoted a single vowel. Such vowels change their forms at the beginning, middle and end of the words. This leads to spelling mistakes. There are also four suggestions for identifying and resolving the long-standing problems of Brahui spelling, by following which spelling mistakes in Brahui language will be 99% accurate.

**Keywords:** Brahui language, unwritten vowels, missing letters, spelling error, spoken and written language.

### Introduction

According to vowels denotations, Brahui is more spoken language than writing, because it does not have a separate script of its own, which would make it possible to distinguish Brahui's rhetorical sounds. Despite this, in the last seven hundred years in general and two hundred, fifty (250) years in particular, Brahui had used Arabic, Roman, Persian, Nastaaliq and sometimes a few letters of Sindhi and Pashto in the Arabic scripts have adapted for this language. The adopted scripts are caused to distort its shape. According to the research of Abdul Raziq Ababaki & Liaquat Sani on Brahui script, written evidence is available in four<sup>1</sup> different scripts in different periods of Brahui language.

### Naskh

Dr. Abdul Rehman Brahui writes; the written history of Brahui is started in 1293 in this era the first ever book of Brahui with name *Khidmat deen* was discovered” after one hundred years the second book with title *Majhool ul ism* <sup>2</sup>.

Naskh was used for the scholars of Maktaba Durkhani and earlier for the Brahui language. The Brahui alphabet used between 40 and 53 in this script<sup>3</sup> This was a time when Brahui language and literature were read by religious and pious people who were related to the adoption of Arabic language and script through the Holy Quran. Among them were the esteemed Malik Dad Qalati, Maulvi Abdul Hakim Mashwani, Allah Bakhsh Zehri and dozens of other scholars.

## Roman

During the British colonial period<sup>4</sup> in Balochistan, Roman script was adopted for Brahui writing style. Other Brahui scholars, including R. Leach in 1838, Denys Bray in 1934, and Duncan Dixie, used the Roman alphabet for Brahui. For which 33 to 35 Brahui alphabets were used.

## Nastaaliq

The Nastaaliq script, written in modern times, is evidenced by the modern Brahui period, the 1960s. When Noor Mohammad Parwana preferred Nastaaliq over Naskh and launched a 15-day Brahui magazine called Elum.

In research from Sabir (2021) "Monthly" Balochi" in 1947 adopted Nastaaliq script for Brahui, the said magazine Balochi was published from Karachi<sup>5</sup>.

The Nastaaliq script used fifty-three alphabets, including Urdu, Persian and Arabic. And to this day Brahui literature is being created in the same script. It also uses the nine Arabic letters ق, ث, ح, ذ, ط, ظ, ص, ض, ر. And their use is causing a phonetic change in the Brahui language. And there are a lot of complications with spelling.

## Brolikva

In 2008, the Brahui Department, University of Balochistan, Quetta, formed the Brahui Language Board to address the problems in Brahui Orthography. The Board's objectives were to approve a new orthography in the style of the Roman alphabet to eliminate spelling errors from the Brahui script. One of the key points on the board was that a different letter or symbol would be used for each of Brahui's voices. The new alphabet was named *Brolikhva* meaning Brahui Roman Likvarh<sup>6</sup>.

According to new research the first ever literary online newspaper of Brahui weekly Talar has published four pages in *Brolikva* after two years the publication of *Brolikva* script has been discontinued by the Talar editorial board.

The author of this research paper was himself the secretary of the board that made the *Brolikva*. A religious tendency was more prevalent among the people at that time. And under a conspiracy, the *Brolikva* script was opposed because the *Brolikva* script was designed to alienate us from religion. And it was also argued that how to translate the Qur'an? And what about books printed in the old script? Etc. etc. In Figure 1, it can be seen that the Brahui newspaper published the news with a perfect and spelling-free script for the Brahui language. Which was closed two years later. In addition to the financial difficulties, the negative thinking of the people played a significant role in the closure of the newspaper. **Figure 1. Brolikva Script (weekly Talar, Quetta)**<sup>7</sup>



### **Standardization of Brahui language and barriers**

Scholars and Brahui writers have their own opinions on how to standardize the Brahui language. In contrast, illiterate or those who live far from urban life have different opinions. In this regard, the dominant class, which consists of literates, seeks to standardize the Brahui language according to their intellect, thinking, analysis, personal ego, ideological groupings and preferences, which barely make up 2.5% to 4% of the Brahui-speaking population. Despite this, a small section wants to impose its will and preference on the remaining 96% of the population and this leads to linguistic problems in Brahui, differences in writing and speaking language.

It is an experience that when the scholars get stuck on the points of disagreement in the debate on the subject of 'Brahui writing' reading, they give the example of these (4%) speakers to make a decision of their choice and will while making decision and Their will and intentions have never been taken into account in the strategy.

The standard status of the Brahui language has been declining due to weak scholarly arguments of intellectuals and Brahui scholars. This section is consciously trying to distort the original Brahui language by placing the linguistic, phonetic features and needs of other languages in a similar manner. The same class is trying to use Brahui language on an experimental basis to justify their opinion by using the weak faith and religious argument to borrow the sounds of other languages.

Just as a dead body needs a soul instead of a garment and make-up, so too the Brahui language needs to know and identify the real linguistic problems and try to solve them. If Brahui written literature is to be given the standard status. And in the context of linguistic issues, the period from 1292 to 1960 and the period from 1960 to up to date, which is seven hundred and fifty years, assumes three thousand books to be printed. Even then, Brahui's spelling and orthographical problems are seven hundred years old. They were the same and are still the same today or these linguistic issues have not been identified.

In contrast, we could not give Brahui the status of Esperanto, the new international language created by Dr. Zame Naf in 1887. because at least 5,000 books and 100 journals were published in Esperanto to facilitate the rules, regulations, publicity, interpretation and general understanding of the Esperanto language <sup>8</sup>.

Sometimes the question comes to mind that perhaps Brahui language has not been able to develop due to difficult economic style like Eskimo languages because the language is affected by physical or geographical conditions. For example, if the land is fertile, i.e., food is easily available, then the people of the language will have enough time to focus on the creation of literature and other cultural activities and where the economy is hardly available, civilization, literature and language and everything stay behind. According to Humboldt's statement that

"The beginning and the end of language cannot be known like other things, so one must suffice to study the middle ground."(Jain, 2003). according to analysis of KMAP, "the study of the past of a language is possible only if its present form is also studied."<sup>9</sup>.

In the same way, the researcher urges to study the present form of the Brahui language, to identify the problems as well as make suggestions for their solution. Implementing the following four suggestions can eliminate the inferiority of Brahui language and all linguistic problems. Brahui's lack of his own script in the past, spelling and other linguistic problems are also the reasons behind the solution of these four suggestions.

### 1. Uniformity in Brahui spoken and written language

The language of a group, tribe or race cannot be standard and acceptable to all people unless the spoken and written language both are the same. 95% of spelling and other linguistic complications can be overcome if the sounds, (vowels and consonants) and syllables that are used while speaking are explained in their exact written form, letters or symbols clarified.

Conversely, if there is a difference between spoken and written language or if the spoken sounds do not match in the written letters, then it becomes impossible to correct the spelling and orthographical issues of the Brahui language.

If we look at this point with reference to Brahui language, we can see a clear difference between spoken and written language. Here every institution, publisher, typist and every writer have their own spelling and spoken language, that is, the pronunciation of speaking and the pronunciation of writing are different from each other. In Table.no 1, is the few examples, where it can be seen difference between spoken language (SL) and written language (WL).

**Table 1. Speaking language (SL) & Written Language (WL)**

	A	B	A1	B2
S.no	SL	WL	SL	WL
1	مامد سديخ Maamad Siddikh	محمد صديق Muhammad Siddique	ميسيت Maseet	مسجد Masjid
2	مسخت Maskhat	مقصد Maqsad	جتا Jitaa	جدا Judaa
3	يسف Eesuf	يوسف Yousaf	خلك Khalk	خلق Khalq
4	جيسف Jeesuf	يوسف Yousaf	اس As	كس as
5	اوزل Aozal	افضل Afzal	اس As	هس hus
6	اودل ابي Awdul Ali	عبدالعلي Abdul Ali	هرا Haraa	ارا araa

There can be thousands of such words and phrases whose spoken pronunciation varies from written to structure. In table no.1, S. No 1-6 and A to B2 shows the code-switching order in Brahui language, it has been observed mostly borrowed voices change their originality in spoken and written language in Brahui. The table no.2 shows the chart were non-Brahui phoneme changes in Brahui phoneme.

**Table 2**

### Barrowed phoneme

	A	B	AA	BB
S. No	Other Phoneme	Brahui Phoneme	Other Phoneme	Brahui Phoneme
1	ث	س	ح	ه ا
2	ذ	ز	ص	س
3	ض	ز	ط	ت
4	ظ	ز	ع	ا حمزه ه
5	ق	ک	د	ت
6	ب	و	د	ڈ (Dialect)
7	ے-ی	ج-ا	ن	م
8	ت	ٹ (Dialect)		

Serial no 1-5 (A) and serial no 1-4 (BB) shows the Arabic barrowed consonants and serial no. 6-8 (A & AA) shows the different dialectal variation of Brahui language in table no.2.

## 2. Single phoneme & single symbol tradition

The second reason that spelling and spelling issues arise is that a phonetic does not follow a single symbol. If a group of letters or symbols are used for one sound (phoneme) in the Brahui language, it causes spelling issues. The Table no.3 shows few examples of short vowels of Brahui where the mono sound (phoneme) changes its symbol at beginning and middle.

**Table 3. Short Vowels**

Missing vowel	Beginning style <sup>10</sup>	Middle style	Ended style	Description
A short vowel	ا (الف زبر)، امب۔ اس۔ اف۔ اخه ، نس، نانا نتو، امبل، الو، اٹ، امبر، انگل،	زبر، خن، خف، نت، ننگ، ڈک، ٹف، متش، سننگت،	ه به، سلہ، غلہ، سیلہ، بدلہ، غولہ، چولہ، گوالہ، غسہ، کسہ، بلہ، یالہ، بٹہ، مٹہ،	There are hundreds of examples like the one above that have one letter or sound in speech but use more than one letter or symbol for them in writing. Which appears to be a conscious attempt at Brahui spelling, writing and linguistic problems.

o long vowel	اُ	پیش،	،	-----	The short vowel /o/ changes with lat the beginning and changes its shape at the end of middle of word, it rarely uses at the end of word
	اُراء، اُف، اُخ، اُشکلن،	نُت، نُسخان، بُت، دُتک،	چک، پُرت		
I Short vowel	(الف زیر)	،(زیر)	،	-----	The short vowel /i/ changes with lat the beginning and changes its shape at the end of middle of word, it rarely uses at the end of word.
	اِس، اِشاف، اِسکول، اِس	بک، بچ، زک،	بک، بچ، زک،		

Therefore, unless the requirements of "one sound, one symbol"<sup>11</sup> in the Brahui language are met, Brahui spelling and writing problems will not be solved.

**Table 4. Long Vowels**

	aa	Bb	cc	Ee	dd
	Missing vowel	Beginning style	Middle style	Ended style	Description
1	À long vowel	آ	ا	ا	The symbol of the phoneme /À/ is same at the middle and at the last. And is change at the beginning of the word.
		آلم، آدینک، آخور، آلوڑ، آن، آستونک، آپڑ	سال، شام، ساگ، شار، بام، باغ، کتام، زراب، ملاس، زوراک	اوناء، چتا، اراء، کتا، نما، دنا، شافا، هوغا، هوکا، تتا	
2	Ì long vowel	ایی	یی	ی	The symbol of Ì is different from each other when it comes at the beginning, middle and at the end of the Brahui word.
		ایلم، ایڑھ،	سلیس، زیل، جیتام، دیر، میر،	دوی، درزی، گلی، بولی، ملی، شاری	
3	ū long vowel	اُو	و	و	The long vowel /ū/ changes its symbol at the beginning and its shape remain one at the middle and at the end of words.
		اُولن، اوره (هوره)، اوکم (ہوکم)	بوز، شوم، دون، شوخ،	سو، دو، رو، جادو، چاکو، بازو،	
4	E long vowel	اے، ایے	ئی	ے	The long vowel /e/ changes its symbol at three positions.
		ایلو، ایپار، ایکان، اینو، ایدے	شیر، پیکار، کاریم، دیار، میر، خیرات	برے، بروے، مرے، سلے، غلے	
5		او	و	و	The long vowel /o/

O long vowel	او، اوکف، اور، اونا، اودے، اوکان، اوڑا	سلوک، دروغ، شروخ، بروک، گنوک	درو، خدو، لخدو، اینو، سلو، تنو، ہشو	changes its symbol at the beginning and its shape remain one at the middle and at the end of words.
--------------------	---	---------------------------------	--	---

The usage of 2bb, 2cc and 4bb, 4cc in table no.4 are same in Brahui language. similarly, 3bb, 3cc, 3ee and 5bb, 5cc, 5ee are same in Brahui language. though the pronunciation of above-mentioned table data are different from each other but in writing language it causes the spelling errors.

### 3. Identification of all Brahui Vowels in written language

In the past the Brahui language gone through with different scripts without being identified. As the scholars urged that Brahui is vowel-oriented language,<sup>12</sup> without Latin (Roman)<sup>13</sup> script rest of all scripts adopted by Brahui in different stages were consonants oriented. because of this problem, Brahui orthography took a permanent wrong direction, which led to spelling issues in Brahui. That is, from the thirteenth century to the present day, it has not been possible to identify and express Brahui vowels in written language.

At present, Brahui has a total of eight vowels, including three short and five long vowels<sup>14</sup> in addition to three diphthongs.

The history of the Brahui written language so far is known to include only a list or expression of 2 or 4 vowels. The rest of the vowels don't reflect in Brahui alphabets though the all vowels are expressible in spoken language.

In research from Sabir<sup>15</sup> (2021) has presented the comparative study of Brahui, Balochi, Urdu and Persian in table no.5. this table concluded with the following points.

- 13 aspirated voices have been added for Brahui which are totally extra. (see the serial no. 3, 6, 8, 10, 14, 16, 20, 22, 26, 28, 48, 50 & 52).
- 09 Arabic alphabets have been added for Brahui language. (see the S. no. 12, 17, 24, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37 & 40)
- 05 special characters were added for Baloch language (see the S.no. 5,11,23,42 & 45).
- Table no. 5 contains only two vowels of Brahui language (S. no. 1 & 55).
- The remaining 6 vowels of Brahui language are missing from the Sabir's list.

#### Table 5

#### Comparative List of Brahui, Balochi, Urdu and Persian Alphabets

S. No	Balochi	Brahui	Urdu	Persian
1	ا	ا	ا	ا
2	ب	ب	ب	ب
3	بھ	بھ	بھ	--
4	پ	پ	پ	پ
5	ف+پ	--	--	--



6	پھ	پھ	پھ	--
7	ت	ت	ت	ت
8	تھ	تھ	تھ	--
9	ٹ	ٹ	ٹ	--
10	ٹھ	ٹھ	ٹھ	--
11	ظ	--	--	--
12	ث	ث	ث	ث
13	ج	ج	ج	ج
14	جھ	جھ	جھ	--
15	چ	چ	چ	چ
16	چھ	چھ	چھ	--
17	ح	ح	ح	ح
18	خ	خ	خ	خ
19	د	د	د	د
20	دھ	دھ	دھ	--
21	ڈ	ڈ	ڈ	--
22	ڈھ	ڈھ	ڈھ	--
23	ذ	--	--	--
24	ذ	ذ	ذ	ذ
25	ر	ر	ر	ر
26	رھ	رھ	رھ	--
27	ڑ	ڑ	ڑ	--
28	ڑھ	ڑھ	ڑھ	--
29	ز	ز	ز	ز
30	ژ	ژ	ژ	ژ
31	س	س	س	س
32	ش	ش	ش	ش
33	ص	ص	ص	ص
34	ض	ض	ض	ض
35	ط	ط	ط	ط

36	ظ	ظ	ظ	ظ
37	ع	ع	ع	ع
38	غ	غ	غ	غ
39	ف	ف	ف	ف
40	ق	ق	ق	ق
41	ک	ک	ک	ک
42	خ+ک	--	--	--
43	ھ	ھ	ھ	--
44	گ	گ	گ	گ
45	غ+ک	--	--	--
46	ل	ل	ل	ل
47	--	ل	--	--
48	ھ	ھ	ھ	--
49	م	م	م	م
50	مھ	مھ	مھ	--
51	ن	ن	ن	ن
52	نھ	نھ	نھ	--
53	و	و	و	و
54	ھ	ہ	ہ	ہ
55	ی	ی	ی	ی
56	ے	ے	ے	ے

#### 4. Brahui as medium of instruction

The fourth and final point is not directly related to the identification of linguistic and orthographic problems. And this effort cannot be embarrassing unless it involves planning for the common and illiterate, the highly educated and for all walks of life.

At present Brahui exist as a language of knowledge as a short and specific group but certainly not an effective means. Unless Brahui can be adopted as a language or medium of instruction from primary to higher level, no method will prove effective and efficient.

The efforts of former governor Balochistan, Nawab Muhammad Akbar Khan Bugti in 1992 was admirable, he was the first official to passed a constitution from provincial assembly for mother tongue languages of Balochistan (Brahui, Balochi and Pashto) as medium of instruction from level one. The second attempt has made in 2014, the

former chief minister Dr. Abdul Malik Baloch was interested to introduce the Brahui, Balochi and Pashto as an additional subject in the level one. but it does not lead to the conclusion that Brahui language was and is needed.

Similarly, in the case of elective subjects in colleges or in the Brahui curriculum of MA to PhD at the university where it is desirable to adopt Brahui as the language of instruction at level 6 to 8. Adoption of Brahui language as medium of instruction by the official could lead to resolve the spelling issues in future.

At the same time, it is impossible for Brahui to become a standard language. And the possibilities will be added when Brahui becomes the language of knowledge, along with language of education or the medium of instruction for every class and every level of education.

Spelling issues in Brahui language can be improved by following the above points. There was no support or opposition to any script at any point. It doesn't matter if the script is from the past or the present or if a new script is in use in the future. However, looking at whatever script is adopted in the context of the above three points, the Brahui spelling problems will be eliminated by 90%.

**Abbreviations:** SL. Spoken language WL. Written language

### Bibliography

- <sup>1</sup>Ababaki, A. R. & Sani, L. A. (2018) برابھوئی رسم الخط ناچار مرحلہ: The Four periods of Brahui Script. Al-Buruz, 10(1), 53–64. <https://scholar.google.com/scholar?oi=bibs&cluster=9785058963127237832&btnI=1&hl=en>
- <sup>2</sup>Brahui, A. R. (2020). Brahui Zuban o Adab ki Mukhtasir Taarekh (3rd ed.). Brahui Academy Quetta.
- <sup>3</sup>Turaab, A. (2008). Naqd Zahanat (ba zaban Brohi) (2nd ed.). Brahui Academy Pakistan.
- <sup>4</sup>Buzdar, W. B. (n.d.). Brahui-Drawidi aur Sindh Tehzeeb. Balochi Academy Quetta.
- <sup>5</sup>Sabir, R. (2021). Brahui aur Balochi ke Lisaani Rawabit. Brahui Adabi Society Pakistan, Quetta.
- <sup>6</sup>Sani, L. A., Ahmed, B., & Razzaq, W. (2014). Dialectal Variation of Brahui Language in Balochistan. Balochistan Review, 31(2), 113–120. <https://scholar.google.com/scholar?oi=bibs&cluster=17354535889390137576&btnI=1&hl=en>
- <sup>7</sup>talar publications Quetta, Balochistan. (2011, January 8). talar. Talarbrahui.Com. <https://talarbrahui.com/05/10/2020/8148/>
- <sup>8</sup>Jain, G. C. (2003). Aam Lisaniyat (2nd ed., Vol. 468). Quomi Council Braey Froghe Urdu New Dehli.
- <sup>9</sup>Jain, G. C. (2003). Aam Lisaniyat (2nd ed., Vol. 468). Quomi Council Braey Froghe Urdu New Dehli.
- <sup>10</sup>Muhammad Shahi, A. G. (2016). Ispeda Rang (Brahui - Urdu Lughat) (1st ed.). Abdul Ghafoor Muhammad Shahi librarian University of Balochistan Quetta.
- <sup>11</sup>Sani, L. A. (2012). one syllable words of Brahui language. Balochistan Review, 27(2), 33–47. <http://web.uob.edu.pk/uob/Journals/Balochistan-Review/data/BR%2002%202012/33-47%20On%20Syllable%20Words%20of%20Brahui%20Language.%20Liaqat%20Ali%20Sani.pdf>
- <sup>12</sup>Sani, L. A., Shahwani, S. A., & Hanfi, M. A. (2014). The history of Brahui alphabet. Balochistan Review, 30(1), 107–114. <http://web.uob.edu.pk/uob/Journals/Balochistan-Review/data/BR%2001%202014/107-114%20The%20History%20of%20Brahui%20Alphabet,%20Dr.%20Liaqat%20Ali%20Sani.pdf>
- <sup>13</sup>Bux, A. (1983). Hand book of the Birouhi Language (2nd ed., Vol. 21). Brahui Academy, Quetta.
- <sup>14</sup>Sani, L. A., Shahwani, S. A., & Hanfi, M. A. (2014). The history of Brahui alphabet. Balochistan Review, 30(1), 107–114. <http://web.uob.edu.pk/uob/Journals/Balochistan-Review/data/BR%2001%202014/107-114%20The%20History%20of%20Brahui%20Alphabet,%20Dr.%20Liaqat%20Ali%20Sani.pdf>
- <sup>15</sup>Sabir, R. (2021). Brahui aur Balochi ke Lisaani Rawabit. Brahui Adabi Society Pakistan, Quetta.