

The Batini (Esoteric) Interpretation of the Holy Qur'an: A Critical Review of Modern Approaches

Dr. Zia ul Haq

*Assistant Professor, College of Shari'ah and Islamic Studies,
University of Sharjah, UAE*

Email: zulhaq@sharjah.ac.ae

Abstract

The esoteric movement began to resurface throughout the Islamic world under new names and appearances, such as "enlightenment" "renewal," and "modernity movements." The principles of classical esotericism are well established in the modern movements and these were inspired and driven by classical esoteric philosophy, which employed esoteric vision as a source and starting point for its intellectual underpinnings, used the same discourse framework in the Qur'anic interpretation. Using a methodological comparison of classical and modern esoteric movements, this study seeks to trace the origins of modern esotericism in the philosophical literature of the classical esotericism. The study discovered areas of agreement and divergence between the two religious dogmas in terms of approach for interpreting and understanding of the holy text.

Keywords: Baitinyy'ah, Esotericism, Qur'an, Kirmani, Ghazali, Hermenutics

Introduction:

In the third century, the Islamic world oversaw a new methodology of the interpretation of the holy text ended up going beyond the classical pattern. This move is known as the esoteric interpretation of the Holy text (Ta'wil al batini) which asserts that the Qur'anic texts contain hidden esoteric meanings that are distinct from the actual exoteric meanings. Some of the sects involved in this tendency included the *Ismailis*, the *Qarmatians*, the *Nusayris*, the *Druze*, the *Sab'iyyah*, and the *Khurramites*.¹

In spite of the disparities in titles and nomenclature, these groups were based on a shared belief: that the Holy Scripture contains two sorts of meanings: visible meanings and invisible meanings, and that every apparent meaning must be accompanied by an inner meaning (or vice versa). When you look closely at the inner meaning of the texts, you can see God's actual goal. The apparent is analogous to the crust, whilst the underlying meaning is analogous to the heart. Rather than being restricted by what the exoteric meaning entails, people must seek out the esoteric meaning, which must be embraced even if it is in direct conflict with the exoteric and actual literary meaning of the Qur'an. Traditional Ismaili thinking is based on the idea that the Holy Qur'an has multiple levels of meaning. A mastery of an elaborate curriculum that leads the individual through progressive study, where one acquires the tools necessary for understanding the Holy Qur'an and is able to relate this understanding to certain basic truths that lie at the heart of the Qur'anic message, can lead to an understanding of these levels of meaning. The instrument required for the process is ta'wil, or hermeneutical analysis, which leads to the root of revelation's original

meaning. The counterpart of ta'wilis tanzil, the part of revelation that determines the formal components of religious life, the containers in which the truths are housed.²

According to this perspective, there is no necessity for any connection to be established between the text's esoteric and exoteric meanings. The esoteric interpretations of a single term can be numerous. According to Al-Daylami, the text's underlying meanings are far more extensive than a simple enumeration of words. This is due to the assertions of certain esoteric imams (Batiniyyah) who claim that the word has seven separate meanings at times and between seventy and seven hundred meanings at other times, respectively.³ They further maintain that the words are nothing more than dead bodies and templates for unveiling meanings.⁴ Knowing that the holy books contain apparent revelations, which are the words read and heard, and hidden meanings, which are the real meanings, the Ikhwan al-Safa' go on to say, acknowledging the texts' esoteric significance.⁵

The ancient esoteric approach to the Qur'an was to use its words as templates for what it saw as esoteric meanings, ignoring the actual clear meanings and constructing interpretations that were far apart from its context and connotations. This approach is in violation of Arabic linguistic standards, as well as the approach of the Holy Prophet's (SAW) companions and senior Islamic exegetes.⁶

The Philosophical Underpinnings of Esotericism: The Relationship Between Word and Meaning

The relationship between word and meaning has been a source of debate among philosophers since the beginning of time, with researchers disputing whether words are real objects or meanings. This is important to remember before getting into the issue of modern esotericism. Although this subject was initially debated mostly among scribes and poets, the concept of dualism (Suna'yyat) subsequently gained popularity among theologians, causing lengthy theological debates.

To begin with, Abu Amr Shaybani⁷ (d. 231 AH) proposed that the word is distinct from the meaning, stating:

"Whoever seeks the good meaning must choose the excellent wording as the good meaning merits the good wording."⁸

This concept implies that the meaning can be communicated in a term that is unworthy of the meaning; it is obvious from this that Abu Amr Shaybani (d. 231 AH) saw the word as distinct from the meaning. In some ways, they regarded the meaning as the original and the words as merely means of expression.

In addition to declaring the "word" to be original, Jahez (d. 255 AH) believed that the words themselves were originals since the most essential thing is to choose excellent words to express the meanings of the words. In addition to that, "all people, including Arabs, Bedouins, and the Quraysh, understand the meanings as they are. Therefore, what make a difference are the words not the

meanings. The growth of tones and the polishing of words are where excellence is reached... this is why poetry is regarded an art form and a type of imagery, "He goes on to speak more."⁹

Implications of the Dispute

Despite being a rational Mu'tazilite, Jahez prioritized the word over meaning in poetry. Each side justified its position in light of the dispute between proponents and opponents of the word in literary circles. Despite the fact that there is no space to discuss these points here, the general theme that arose was the difference in word and meaning, which unavoidably had an impact on theology, Qur'anic miracles, and esoteric interpretation of the texts in the subsequent period. The dispute got underway, and the differing approaches of jurists and Sufis to the interpretation of the Holy Qur'an came to the fore, with jurists focusing on the outward meaning and Sufis on the inward meaning. Thus, the debate over word and meaning was not limited to literary and artistic circles; subsequent times saw theologians join in the debate over word and meaning in the interpretation of religious issues and texts.

The Emergence of the Modern Esoteric Movement

The philosophical dispute discussed previously spawned esoteric interpretations of religious scriptures. The Ismaili, Nasiriyah, Alawite and Hunzai sects are the most well-known of these esoteric religious sects in modern times. In political and social contexts, some organizations used the term esoteric to disparage their opponents. "They were given this title due to their belief that every apparent word has an interior meaning and that every revelation has an interpretation,"¹⁰ writes Allama Shahristani (d. 549 AH), "and they have numerous titles on the tongues of the people, such as Batiniy'ah, Qaramita'h, Muzdaki'ah, and in Khurasan, they were given the names Talimi'yya'h and Mulhid'ah."

"Their ultimate goal is to nullify the Shariah laws," writes Imam Ghazali of the Esoteric movements:

"وغيرهم الأقصى إبطال الشرائع فإنهم إذا انتزعوا عن العقائد موجب الظواهر قدروا على الحكم بدعوى الباطن على حسب ما

يوجب الانسلاخ عن قواعد الدين إذ سقطت الثقة بموجب الألفاظ الصريحة فلا يبقى للشرع عصام يرجع إليه ويعول عليه."¹¹

"Because if they are stripped of outward beliefs, they will be able to rule according to the internal claim, which may necessitate a deviation from the rules of the religion, because trust in the explicit words has been lost, and there is nothing left on which the Shariah can be relied upon."

The Esoteric movement further backs up their assertion with Sur'ah al-Baqarah verse 129, which says:

"رَبَّنَا وَابْعَثْ فِيهِمْ رَسُولًا مِّنْهُمْ يَتْلُو عَلَيْهِمْ آيَاتِكَ وَيُعَلِّمُهُمُ الْكِتَابَ وَالْحِكْمَةَ وَيُزَكِّيهِمْ إِنَّكَ أَنْتَ الْعَزِيزُ الْحَكِيمُ"¹²

"Our Lord! And raise up in their midst a messenger from among them who shall recite unto them Thy revelations, and shall instruct them in the Scripture and in wisdom and shall make them grow. Lo! Thou, only Thou, art the Mighty, Wise."

Consequently, they assert that the wisdom in this verse and other like verses relates to the Qur'an's hidden esoteric nature, which is inaccessible to the common person and can only be grasped by the Imam of the time, and that this is the case. According to Tabarani's narration, the Holy Prophet (SAW) says:

" لو كنت متخذًا خليلًا لآخذت أبا بكر خليلًا، ولكن صاحبكم خليل الله، وأنزل القرآن على سبعة أحرف ولكل آية

ظهر وبطن".¹³

"If I make a companion, He will be Abu Bakr, but I am the friend of God," and that the Qur'an was revealed in seven letters, with each verse having both apparent and invisible meaning.

However, Ahl-e-Sunnah do not accept these arguments of Ahl-e-Batin as correct in light of such verses and hadiths, and instead consider them to be irrational and based on ignorance of the Qur'an. Aa'mdi (d. 631 AH) says while giving a general explanation of all such traditions in which the words of Zahir and Batin have appeared:

"وهذه كلها مراسلات لا تقوم بما حجة أصلا ولو صحت لما كان لهم في شيء منها حجة بوجه من الوجوه لأنه لو كان كما

ذكروا لكل آية ظهر وبطن ولكننا لا سبيل لنا إلى علم الباطن".¹⁴

"All of these testimonies are inaccurate and cannot be regarded; even if they are accurate, have no relevance to the subject under consideration, because if each verse has an inner meaning, we have no way of knowing what that meaning is."

Baghdadi (d. 429 AH) writes about these interpretations:

"فزعموا أن معنى الصلاة موالاة إمامهم والحج زيارته والمراد بالصوم الإمساك عن إفشاء سر الإمام دون الإمساك عن

الطعام وزعموا أن من عرف معنى العبادة سقط عنه فرضها".¹⁵

"So they claimed that the meaning of prayer is loyalty to their Imam, and the purpose of Hajj is to visit the Imam, and that the meaning of fasting is not abstaining from food but abstaining from disclosing the Imam's secret, and they claimed that whoever knew the meaning of worship did not need to perform acts of worship,"

When it comes to debating esoteric philosophy, theologians have fairly rejected such esoteric interpretations, describing them as illogical and absurd. When Shatibi (d. 760 AH) wrote denouncing the esoteric interpretation of Islam:

"قوم أرادوا إبطال الشريعة جملة وتفصيلا وإلقاء ذلك فيما بين الناس لينحل الدين في أيديهم".¹⁶

"Some people intended to remove the Sharia completely and promote the thought among the public so that the religion would be dissolved in their hands,"

Following this unique hermeneutic approach, the esoteric tendency abolished the obligations of Islam's major laws, content with understanding their esoteric meanings (as they claim), and emphasized that anyone who understood the esoteric meaning of acts of worship relinquished his assignment to them and was no longer accountable to carry out those acts of worship.¹⁷ Following this line of thinking, the esoterics saw all religious obligations as symbols and allusions to higher truths that were commensurate with their logical and doctrinal foundation. Examples include ablution, which has evolved into a symbol of renewing the covenant with the imam of the time, prayer, which has evolved into a symbol of communicating with and making supplications to the current imam, and zakat, which has evolved into a symbol of spreading knowledge while exempting those who do not deserve to receive it.¹⁸ On top of that, they allowed apparent Shariah prohibitions such as fornication and alcohol usage, among others, on the basis that they are not binding on persons who comprehend the esoteric and true meaning of Shariah requirements.¹⁹

In recognition of the fact that every outward has an inward, these people refer to prayers as two prayers, namely, an outward and an inward prayer, and the same is true of all other pillars of Islam, as Hammadi writes:

"فالزكاة مفروضة في كل عام مرة، وكذلك الصلاة من صلاحها مرة في السنة فقد أقام الصلاة بغير تكرار، لأن الصلاة

صلاتان، والزكاة زكاتان، والصوم صومان والحج حجان، وما خلق الله من ظاهر إلا وله باطن، يدل على ذلك."²⁰

Zakat is only required once a year, and the same is true of "Salah," and if someone prayed only once a year without repetition, that would be sufficient because prayer is two prayers (inward and outward), and an and zakat (Charity) is two zakat, and fasting is two fasting and Hajj (Pilgrimage) is two Hajj.

Ibn Hayyun writes of Islam's fifth pillar:

"إن للحج ظاهرا وباطنا فظاهره الإتيان للبيت العتيق لقضاء المناسك عنده وتعظيمه وباطنه الذي جعل الظاهر دليلا عليه

إتيان امام الزمان من نبي وإمام لأن إمام الزمان مثله في الباطن مثل البيت الحرام."²¹

"Pilgrimage" has two dimensions: inward and outward The outward pilgrimage is to the house of God in order to perform the ceremonies and glorify it, whereas the inward pilgrimage is to the righteous imam, who is inwardly comparable to the house of God.

Besides esoteric theological literature and esoteric interpretations, theologians in general have looked at esoteric interpretations in depth, and the esoteric (Batini) religious literature has been strongly questioned as a result of these interpretations. "Then they claim that prayer, zakat, fasting, and other obligations are not required," says Malti in his book:

إنما هو شكر للمنع وأمر الرب لا يحتاج إلى عبادة خلقه وإنما ذلك شكرهم فمن شاء فعل ومن شاء لم يفعل والاختيار في

ذلك إليهم".²²

These are expressions of thankfulness to the Lord, and the Lord does not require acts of devotion from his creatures, and these devotions are nothing more than a demonstration of reverence for Him on the part of the humans. As a result, individuals have the option of carrying out or refraining from carrying out the tasks.

This new hermeneutic approach to the interpretation of the Quranic text resulted in a completely different understanding of the major Islamic teachings as well as the definitive mandates of Islamic Sharia, transforming the book from its actual visible meanings to its esoteric hidden meanings, as well as a completely different understanding of the major Islamic teachings and the definitive mandates of Islamic Sharia. As a result of this perspective, their faith in God was separated from what was understood and accomplished in light of the Islamic texts. They stripped God of all of his characteristics and relied instead on a "pure negation" (Nafi Mutlaq) that was founded solely on the negation of all of God's existential characteristics. Moreover, they ascribed to God various attributes that are not found in the Qur'an or the Sunnah, such as the "First and creative mind" "al-Aql Awal," and the belief that God Almighty is an idol because he is deserving of worship; rather, he is the place of the "First and creative mind" "aql awal," and the belief that God Almighty is an idol because he is deserving of worship; rather, he is the he is the place of the "First and creative mind" "aql awal".²³ The Prophet's soul receives information from the "creative mind," and the manifestation of this information varies according to the Prophet's mental and spiritual strength, preparation, and perfections, according to this school of thought. As a result, they came to the conclusion that prophethood is a learned trait rather than a divine choice.²⁴

According to this approach, the Qur'an is not God's message, but rather the Prophet's, who expressed what he got from divine favors, and they also disputed the prophets' and messengers' miracles, considering them as slander and superstition.²⁵ They reinterpreted all of the major events of the Last Day upon which it is founded, such as death, the grave, the resurrection, the recompense, heaven, and fire, and turned them into symbols of esoteric meanings that have nothing to do with their apparent reality. They make fun of Muslims who believe these statements are factual and that they are real.²⁶

As a result, the esoteric trend abolished all manifestations of religion, the alteration of its characteristics, and the deletion of its boundaries that distinguish it from other religions. As per the esoteric interpretation the religion has become inclusive of all doctrines and opinions, because now there is no longer a single legal interpretation left to which people must adhere. The founders of esotericism attempted to justify their teaching by inferring it from Sharia scriptures and Ahl al-Bayt traces, and what they depended on was a narration recounted from the Prophet (SAW), who said: ما نزلت عليّ آية إلا ولها ظهر "No verse was revealed to me except that it had an esoteric and exoreic meanings".²⁷

A great deal of effort has been put in by mainstream Islamic academics to challenge the esoteric approach to the interpretation of the Holy Quran, and they have written numerous volumes to that effect. They discussed the intellectual roots of the movement and countered them with rational and Shari'ah-compliant proofs. They also outlined the movement's fraudulent techniques in spreading its ideas and doctrines, which they described as "deceptive tactics." Muslim scholars were unanimous in their belief that the esoteric movement was erroneous and that it was incompatible with Islam's reality and teachings. As a result of the ongoing efforts of mainstream Muslim intellectuals to combat the esoteric trend, it remained isolated and alien in Islamic thought, as well as warped in its ideas and perceptions, and was neither accepted nor extensively disseminated among Muslims.

Esotericism in its New Age

The esoteric concept began to resurface in the Islamic arena, albeit under a new guise and shape, with new labels such as 'enlightenment' movement, 'renewal' movement, modernism, and hermeneutic movement. The Arab modernist school of thought clearly fulfills the characteristics of a given esotericism; it accepted the truth of esoteric theory and adhered to its spirit; it has made esoteric vision a guiding principle of its origins and a starting point for its epistemological premises; and it has the same consequences as ancient esotericism. In the reality of esoteric interpretation, one rarely notices a distinction between the two shapes.

A careful examination of current esotericism uncovers a variety of indicators and evidences suggesting a strong connection between the two dogmas, as well as their systematic convergence. To demonstrate our thesis, we shall discuss the methodology for analyzing the Qur'anic text and the methodologies for understanding the major ideological foundations of Islamic Sharia.

Methodological Convergence Between Old and new Esotericism

According to several key Ismaili philosophers in the past, the term ta'wil is used to interpret sharia law, sacred history, and creation, as well as anthropomorphic depictions of God in religious art. In the words of Qadi al-Nu'man, a renowned Fatimid Muslim jurist, "Thus your Lord will choose you and teach you the symbolic interpretation (ta'wil) of happenings (ahadith)".²⁸ Nasir-i Khusraw, a renowned Fatimid dignitary, asserted that revelation had transformed intellectual subjects into a state that could be grasped by the general public (tanzil). Ta'wil is required in order to restore them to their original mental state. Instead of being satisfied with the exoteric form, he suggests that people seek for someone who can communicate the esoteric meaning to them. When he said this, he was making a reference to the Imam of the moment. Further, Al Mu'ayyad fi l-Din al-Shirazi, another significant Ismaili thinker, claims that ta'wil is what ties the beginning (source) of the circle of existence with its conclusion (destination).²⁹ The modernist esoteric discourse follows the same methodology as the ancient esoteric view when it comes to understanding legal texts. Both agree that the legal text does not lead to the reality and that it lacks any constants or significant meanings. Rather, it is a text that may take on a variety of meanings and can be

interpreted in a variety of ways.³⁰ According to Muhammad Arkoun, the holy text is subject to all meanings, and no translation or interpretation can permanently close it or drain it.³¹ He goes on to say that the Qur'an contains a set of connotations and possible meanings that are offered to all people.³² In this regard, Hasan Hanafi pointed out that the legal text changes with time in terms of meaning and interpretation because it is a template without substance that can be used depending on the circumstances.³³ Tayeb Tizini argues that the Qur'an is little more than indicators that often represent the image that consciousness receives of a thing, rather than referring to precise meanings.³⁴

Nasr Hamid Abu Zayd, on the other hand, attempted to strip the Quranic text of all set meaning and purpose, concluding that it is nothing more than a blank template of content, and that even the Prophet (SAW) himself was unable to determine the meaning of the Quranic text: The Prophet's knowledge of the text symbolizes the initial stages of the text's movement in its interaction with the human mind, and we should not pay heed to assertions of religious discourse that the Prophet's understanding of the legal text is identical.³⁵ "The vice man does not stop at the apparent meaning of a word; rather, he digs deeper and deeper until he reaches the meaning of the meaning, which is an invisible depth rather than the apparent surface," explains Ali Harb. He further describes the new esoteric view in the most straightforward manner possible, illustrating the extent to which the two esoteric dogmas are compatible with one another. As a result, "the critical reader's goal is not to be taken in by what the text says; rather, his task is to be emancipated from the text's meaning in order to understand what the text doesn't say".³⁶ The Qur'an, according to Harb, is the type of text that cannot be exhausted or closed down by any interpretation or ideology.³⁷ Anyone may interpret it in any way they see fit in accordance with their own ideas.³⁸

The idea of contemporary esoteric thought is founded on two fundamental premises: the application of modern Western philosophical approaches to the interpretation and analysis of the Islamic heritage, such as anthropology, linguistics, and literary semiotics. Muhammad Arkoun elaborates:

The critical task at hand is as follows: Rereading all Islamic heritage in light of contemporary linguistic, historical, social, and anthropological views, i.e. in comparison to other religious heritage, most notably that of the Christianity.³⁹

Second, to draw attention to the vast cognitive dimensions that the Arabic language has failed to comprehend, convey, or illustrate.⁴⁰ These criteria were summed up by Arkoun in the phrase dialectical thought, language, and history.

The new esoteric notion raises doubt on the validity of the Qur'an's text, thinking that the Qur'an was manipulated during the shift from oral to written and codified stages:

The stage of oral dialogue gave way to the stage of the closed official textual blog, i.e. the stage of the Qur'an.) In such instances, deletion, selection, and language manipulation are all common acts. While not all spoken conversation is

recorded, some data is lost along the way. When we learn about the destruction of certain manuscripts, such as Ibn Masoud's Qur'an, we keep a record of it.⁴¹

In this context, new esoteric thought regards the Holy Qur'an as one of many religious books, as Arakon maintains:

"I say that the Qur'an is only one of many texts that contain the same level of complexity and abundant meanings, such as the Torah, the Gospels, and the founding texts of Buddhism or Hinduism." Each of these major volumes' fundamental texts has undergone historical modifications and may undergo further modifications in the future.⁴²

Our purpose here isn't to provide a rebuttal to Arakon's point of view on these issues. All we want to accomplish here is compare and contrast ancient and modern esoteric approaches to the interpretation of the sacred text. For instance, modern esotericism holds that it is not necessary to read the religious text in order to discover God's purpose; rather, it is necessary to seek out meanings for the text that come to mind, even if they contradict what the Companions of the Holy Prophet (SAW) and mainstream Islamic scholars understood. According to this perspective, the miracle of the Qur'an is not due to its declaration, lofty eloquence, judgments, structure, or significance; rather, it is the strongest text that allows for an infinite number of interpretations, accepts an infinite number of possibilities, and accommodates all contradictions that represent its truth and purpose!⁴³ When modernist discourse reached this conclusion, it proceeded to condemn scholars, commentators, and jurists who disagreed, referring to them as superficial, uneducated, and dumb much like old esotericism had done.⁴⁴

According to this interpretation, the Quranic text, which integrates beliefs and actual acts of worship, is made ineffective, and the articles of faith are viewed as symbolic artifacts whose meaning and purpose vary according to the time, place, and circumstance in which they are employed. Ancient esoteric traditions viewed faith as a concept that a person builds about something sacred and that may change in response to the individual's current circumstances. However, modernist discourse views faith as a notion that a person develops about something sacred that is subject to change in response to changing circumstances, and God is reduced to a concept devoid of actuality.⁴⁵ "God" is a purely psychological construct that exists only in the mind. Hanafi reprints God's name as a representation of man's desire. "God is nothing but the loaf for the hungry, the freedom for the prisoner, and justice for poor" Hanfi argues.⁴⁶

Muhammad Arkoun emphasizes at every chance that God is a flexible idea that evolves in reaction to events. He repudiates the orthodox Muslim understanding of God, which presupposes the existence of a transcendent, eternal God.⁴⁷ This is why Muhammad Arkoun is urging Muslims to redefine God in a way that is more relevant to our day, claiming that the traditional view is invalid and terrifies humankind's minds.⁴⁸ According to ancient esotericism, the revelation is the result of the Prophet's mind

responding to the information pondered upon him by the first creative mind, "aql awal." Contemporary discourse shares a similar perspective, viewing the revelation as an expression of the Prophet's spiritual experience and his flowing imagination, as well as how it intersects with the social and psychological situation in which he (The prophet) lives, rather than as a divinely inspired revelation to His Prophet through Gabriel or as something that exists outside of time and space.

The Origin of the Modern Esoteric literature

As previous esoteric literature does give any important to the words and actual meanings of the Holy Qur'an as Dr. Sohail states:

" يرون أن "من عرف الباطن سقط عنه عمل الظاهر وخرج من حد المملوكية ورق العبودية إلى حد الحرية".⁴⁹

According to them the one who knew the inner meaning does not need to act according to the outward meanings and he will leave the boundary of servitude to the limit of freedom.

In this context Hammadi writes:

ومن هذا المنطلق ذهبوا إلى تأويل العبادات كلها تأويلاً بعيداً عن فهم العقل، ومنطق اللغة، ومنهج الدين".⁵⁰

From this point of view, the esoterics went to interpreting all the acts of worship away from the logic of language, and the principles of the religion.

The modern esoteric movement also established its basis on the old issue of the word and meaning. Ali Harb conveys the truth of the new esoteric view in the cleanest and most clear language possible, revealing the degree of the two esoterics' congruence.

"The genius does not stop at the obvious that is spoken by, but rather turns the deep, the hidden, and the hidden; that is, he seeks the meaning of the meaning, and the meaning of the meaning is nothing but the apparent, the surface, and the signifying form, and it has hidden itself and turned into an invisible depth, content, or interior."⁵¹

Regarding his understanding of the truth of revelation, Hassan Hanafi believes that the Qur'an is no longer the word of God revealed to his Prophet, but rather the words of the Messenger through which he communicated the feelings that had been pondered on him and propelled his great imagination to bring out to us what we now call (the Holy Qur'an), according to the traditional interpretation. Its origins are identical to those of human speech. As another example, revelation did not cease with Muhammad's (SAW) prophethood, but rather is a state that continues as long as human activity does; this is because man must respond to his external reality, and thus could not stop on the state of revelation that passed through the prophets many years ago.⁵²

"Paradise and Hell are happiness and pain in this world, not in another one," Hasan Hanafi

explains. Heaven is what a person receives from this world's good, while Hell is what a person receives from its wicked.⁵³ "Is it not important for us to get rid of the sarcasm that talks about the Paradise of God replete with poplars and rivers of wine and honey linked with the poetic imagination of the Bedouins?" says Muhammad Arkoun.⁵⁴

Many examples of esoteric interpretation of Islamic principles, such as the major acts of worship that symbolize the pillars of Islam, may be found in contemporary esoteric literature; they have changed from their original shapes in the new esoteric doctrine.⁵⁵ There is no unified Islam with common origins and precise ideas that people are obligated to follow, and there are no apparent acts of devotion that are mandatory on all Muslims, according to both ancient and contemporary esotericism organizations. There is no real Islam that is compatible with the truth, but each person has his/her own Islam and perception, and all perceptions are accurate, even if they contradict one another.⁵⁶

According to contemporary esoteric scholar Allama Hunzai, the second element of Shari'ah is purity, which entails abstaining from all Shari'ah obligations except those imposed by the Imam of the Time (Imam zaman), as he explains: "The second element is purity, and purity is to renounce the previous constitution and to consider what the Imam of the Time says as the truth."⁵⁷ He interprets Surah Baqarah verse No. 45, which states, "And seek help via patience and prayer."⁵⁸ Patience is the Prophet (SAW), and Salat is his successor i.e Maulana Murtaza Ali, writes Allama Hunzai. Help should be sought from Allah through these people, since this is what has been instructed, and this is the finest method.⁵⁹ According to him, if a person becomes pious, the Shari'ah rules are lifted from his shoulders, and the religious rules are made easier for him, as he writes: Keep in mind that Allah Almighty wants ease for the Muslims, but the question arises as to whether Allah Almighty wants to provide us with convenience and ease and not want any difficulty in the religious rules? What can stop him from expressing his will and manifesting his power? What should the servants do in order to be granted so enormous mercy? So the answer can be found in the Qur'an itself, in God's order.⁶⁰ And whomever fears Allah, Allah will make his task simple.⁶¹

According to him, the sole purpose of fasting is to avoid sins, as he writes: "The fourth element is fasting, and fasting means keeping your seven limbs free from all external and internal sins according to God Almighty's command,⁶² " as God Almighty says in the story of Maryam: "I made a vow of fasting for God's sake, so I can't talk to any human today."⁶³

In his book "Ladder of Knowledge," he describes Jihad, saying, "The actual jihad is the spiritual jihad that man fights against himself and the devil."⁶⁴ "The esoteric and spirituality is the essential and actual war, which is from God and the Prophet, and is under the patronage of the Lord of all times." On the day of the battle of Uhud, the Prophet (SAW) stated, "On the day of the battle of Uhud, a caller called out, "There is no one heroic except Ali, and no sword except Zulfiqar, and while this is a sort of appreciation to Ali but there's also the fact that the name of "Ali (RA)" refers to the light of Imamate,

which exists in all eras and is unparalleled in the struggle of spirituality, knowledge, and wisdom, and Zulfiqar's interpretation is the dominant argument, i.e. whoever employs Imam Zaman's spiritual understanding.⁶⁵ Victory in the personal realm is always for him"⁶⁶. The seventh pillar is Hajj, and Hajj is to raise your hand from this mortal inn and keep asking for the sustaining inn," he continues, explaining that Hajj entails leaving the world and pursuing the Hereafter.

"The pilgrimage has outward and inward meanings, its outward meaning is to come to the House of God to do the rituals with it and to honor it, and inwardly, it means to visit the imam because the imam of time is like the house of God in inner sense," writes Ibn Hayyun.⁶⁷

Within the Muslim community, there is almost unanimous consensus that the Quran has hidden meanings. Not all esoteric readings of the Quran, on the other hand, are right. Esoteric Interpreters have been accused of exaggerating the metaphorical features of the Quran and misrepresenting its meaning by claiming privileged knowledge of its contents, which has led to a backlash against them.⁶⁸ The authority of the person who derives these meanings is also being called into doubt at this point. Mainstream theologians were willing to embrace the beliefs if certain conditions were met by an interpreter.⁶⁹ An important need is that the interpretation must not contradict the Quran's true meaning, which is one of the most important requirements. Imam Suyuti believed that careful exegesis was necessary in order to avoid misconceptions. Complete gnosis and the purity of religion, according to Taftazani, can be reached when the subtle references of the Quran are harmonized with the literal sense.⁷⁰

Methodological Flaws in the New Esoteric Literature

In the case of modern esotericism, the literature contains various methodological flaws. I'll highlight a few of these, the first of which is the lack of documentation from Islamic sources despite their availability, as well as documentation from Orientalist references that are antagonistic to Islam and Muslims in the vast majority of cases. Muhammad Arkoun, one of the founders of modern esotericism, derived his accounts of Islamic history from orientalist literature rather than from Islamic sources.⁷¹ He used the same strategy in his book *Islamic Thought*, quoting texts and references from orientalist sources to substantiate his conclusions.⁷²

Another fallacy present in contemporary esotericism literature is the claim that there is no single Islam, but rather a number of Islams that differ according to the cultural and ethnic groups that adhere to it instead.⁷³ Due to the fact that Islam is one religion, both in its origins and in its actuality, and that it is established on the Noble Qur'an and the authentic Sunnah of the Prophet that is in accordance with it. To validate their claims modern esotericism refers to the different modes of understandings and interpretations of well-known legal issues where there are disputes among academics, some of which are founded on traditions and practices. But all these are the different modes of interpretations that do not violate the Sharia'h. Another methodological flaw in the esoteric literature is Exaggeration in praising

and glorifying what they call for, and degrading the value of what their opponents call for, as a result of which they denounce their opponents' doctrinal, religious, and positional tendencies, and exaggeration in glorifying their ideologues, are used to justify their own positions.⁷⁴ Beside this modern esotericism frequently makes the mistake of claiming that hadith scholars based their critical approach on al-jarh and ta'deel – that is, criticism of the chain of transmission rather than criticism of the intellect – and this is a grave error because the approach of Hadith scholars is actually based on what the mind requires in its foundations and details.

Apart from that, the bulk of current esotericists reject scientific interpretations of the Holy Qur'an, do not embrace them, and believe that nothing in the Qur'an or hadith should be sought that was not already general knowledge among Arabs at the time of revelation. They support their position with a variety of reasons and disclaimers, all of which they believe are valid. They typically contend that if the Quran contained scientific facts, why Muslims would not have discovered them or learned about them before to non-Muslims?⁷⁵ This argument completely misses the point, which is whether or not the Qur'an contains scientific miracles. Yes, the Noble Qur'an is a scientific miracle, containing hundreds of scientific facts; other works have been classified as such. and the Qur'anic scientific miracles have become a well-established and widely accepted fact, there is no scientific, legal, or philosophical reason to disregard or ignore them.

However, Muslims' scientific illiteracy, combined with their lack of contribution to current scientific discoveries, explains why they were sluggish to benefit from scientific references in the Noble Qur'an before they were discovered by others. Another issue is our backwardness, which does not exclude us from observing Qur'anic scientific miracles. Nonetheless, some Muslims who specialize in Qur'an scientific interpretation have explored several scientific references in the Qur'an and discovered previously undiscovered facts as a result.⁷⁶

All of the evidences above indicate that the Qur'anic text is undergoing a new wave of esotericism, as well as a revival of the esoteric movement, which was previously used to undermine pillars of Islamic teachings. The esoteric movement attempted and continues to strive to modify the fundamental characteristics and subjective characteristics of Islam. For Muslims who are unfamiliar with their religion, the modern esoteric movement has taken on a new dimension. The esoteric approach results in a corrupted, altered, and distorted Islam, which is not the authentic Islam followed by the Prophet, peace and blessings be upon him, and his companions, as well as subsequent Muslims. Due to the close methodological connection between the two dogmas, the contemporary esoteric movement was eager to adopt the old esotericism and praise, highlight, and resurrect its devotees, as Nasr Hamid Abu Zaid and Ali Harb did with Ibn Arabi, Muhammad Arkoun did with Abu Hayyan al-Tawhidi, and Hassan did Hanafi with al-Suhrawardi, by repurposing their ideas in a new way.⁷⁷ They all portrayed these esotericists as symbols of rationality, intellect, and advancement in Islamic history.

8. Arakon, Muhammad, "الفكر الأصولي واستحالة التأصيل", (Dar al Yaqdah al Arabi'ah, Beirut, 2002)
9. Arakon, Muhammad, "Tarikhiyy'ah al Fikr Islami", (Dar al Shuruq, Beirut, Lebanon, 2007)
10. Ali, Harb, "Naqd al Nas" [https://www.noor-book.com/%D9%83%D8%AA%](https://www.noor-book.com/%D9%83%D8%AA%20) , Retrieved: 20-06-2021
11. Baghdadi, Abdel Qahir, "al-Farq bain al Fir'aq", Vol. 1, (Dar al A'afaq al Jadid'ah, Beirut, Lebanon, 1977)
12. Daiylami, Muhammad Bin Hasan, "بيان مذهب الباطنية وبطلانه" ed. Shadu, Tahh'an, (Maktaba'h al Ma'arif, Riyadh, KSA, 1995)
13. Ghalib, Mustafa, "Sinan Rashid Uddin: Shiekh al Jabal al Salis", (Dar al Yaqdah al Arabia, Beirut, 1967)
14. Ghalib, Mustafa "رسائل إخوان الصفا", Vol. 4, (Dar al-Maktaba'h al Hilal, Beirut, Lebanon, 1079)
15. Hamm'adi, Muhammad Bin Malik, "Kashf al asrar al Batiniyyah wa akhbar al Qaramit'ah", Vol. 3 (Matb'ah Anwar al Uloom, Baghdad, 1357 A.H)
16. Hanafi, Hasan, " al Yasar al Islami wal Wahd'ah al Arabi'ah", Vol. 2 (Dar al Yaqdah al Arabi'ah, Beirut, Lebanon, 2002)
17. Hanafi, Hasan, " Faith to Revelation", Vol. 1, (Dar al Tanwir li Tiba'ah wal Nashr, Beirut, Lebanon, 1988)
18. Hasan, Hanfi, " Heritage and Revival", (Dar al Nashr, Beirut, Lebanon, 2012)
19. Hammadi, Muhammad Bin Malik, " Kashf al Asrar al Batiniyyah".
20. Hanafi, Hasan, " From Faith to Revelation", Vol. 4, (Dar al Tanwir li Tiba'ah wal Nashr, Beirut, Lebanon, 1988)
21. Hunzai, Nasir Uddin, "Matloob al Mumineen", (Danishgah Khana' Hikmat, Karachi, Pakistan, 1965)
22. Hunzai, Nasir Uddin, " Ladder of Knowledge", (Danishgah Khana' Hikmat, Karachi, Pakistan, 1965)
23. Hunzai, Nasir Uddin, "Ya Ali Madad", (Danishgah Khana' Hikmat, Karachi, Pakistan, 1965)
24. Jahiz, Amr Bin Bahr, Al-Bayyan wa Al-Tabeen, ed. Abdul Salam Haroon, vol. 1, (Dar and Maktab al-Hilal, Beirut, Lebanon, 1997)
25. Jahiz, Amr Bin Bahr, Kitab al-Hayawan, vol. 2, (Dar al-Kitab al-Alamiya, Beirut, 1424 AH)
26. Jabiri, Muhammad Abid, " Bunya'h al Aql", (Dar al Yaqda'h al Arabi'ah, Bierut, 2002)
27. Kirmani, Ahmed Hamid Uddin, " Rahat al Aql", ed. Mustafa Ghalib, (Dar al Tur'ath al Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon, 1967)
28. Malti, Abdur Rehman, " كتاب التنبيه والرد على أهل الأهواء والبدع ", (Maktab'ah Madbuli, Cairo, Egypt, 1993)

29. Mahmoud M. A. The Qur'an and its interpreters. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1984)
30. Nanji A. Shi'ismaili Interpretations of The Holy Qur'an", (The Institute of Ismaili Studies, London, 1980)
31. Omairi, Sultan"الاتجاه الباطني في تشكله الجديد", (Mujallah al-Bayan, Vol. 296, KSA)
32. Qazi, Numan, "Asas al Ta'wil", (Dar al Ma'arif, Egypt, 1995)
33. Qazi, Numan, " T'awil al Da'ayim", Vol. 1, (Dar al Ma'arif, Cairo, Egypt, 1995)
34. Razi, Ahmad Bin Hamdan " Ila'am al Nubu'ah" (Anjuman Shaninshahi, Falsafa' Iran, 2018)
35. Suyuti, Jalal al-Din, " بغية الوعاة في طبقات اللغويين والنحاة،" ed. Abu al-Fazl, Ibrahim, Vol. 2, (al-Maktaba al Asri'ah, Saida, Lebanon, 2002)
36. Sharistani, Abdel Karim, "al-milal Wa al-Nihal", Vo. 1, (Dar al Sadir, Beirut, 1999)
37. Shatibi, Ibrahim Bin Musa, " al-Itisam", Vol. 1, (Matba'h al Sa'adah, Cairo, Egypt, 1977)
38. Sajistani, Abu Yaqoob " Isbat al Nubu'aat", ed. Arif Tamir, (Dar Sadir, Beirut, Lebanon, 1982)
39. Shurfi, Abdel Majid, " Islam between the Revelation and history", (Dar al Shuruq, Beirut, Lebanon, 2016)
40. Sufi Tafsir and Isma'ili Ta'wil, <http://www.arches.uga.edu/~godlas/suftaf/suftaftawil.html>
41. Tu'aimah, Sabir, "al-Aqa'id al Batiniyya'h" (Dar al Sadir, Beirut, Lebanon,
42. him in the third generation of Muslim scholars See for more details.
43. Tibrani, Sulaiman Bin Ahmad, "al-Mujam al Kabir", ed. Hamdi, Abdel Majid, Vol. 9, (Maktabah Ibn Taymiyyah, Cairo, 1994)
44. Tizini, Tayyib, In front of the problematic structure and reading of the Qur'anic text ", (Dar al Yanambi, Beirut, 1997)
45. .Ta'an, Ahmed Idrees"تاريخية النص: القرآن الكريم", p. 346, <https://waqfeya.net> /book.php, Retrived: 21-06-2021
46. Tusi, Khawja Nasir Uddin, "Matlub al Mominin", Trans. Hunzai, Nasir Uddin, (Dar al Hikmah al Ismaili'ah, Hunza, Gilgit, Pakistan, 1980)
47. Ta'an, Ahmed Idrees"تاريخية النص العلمانيون والقرآن الكريم", p. 734, <https://waqfeya.net> /book.php



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

- ¹ . Daiylami, Muhammad Bin Hasan, "بيان مذهب الباطنية ويطلانه" ed. Shadu, Tahh'an, (Maktaba'h al Ma'arif, Riyadh, KSA, 1995), PP. 21-22
- ² . Nanji A. Shi'ismaili Interpretations of The Holy Qur'an", (The Institute of Ismaili Studies, London, 1980) pp.39-49.
- ³ . Ibid. p. 39
- ⁴ . Tu'aimah, Sabir, "al-Aqa'id al Batiniyya'h" (Dar al Sadir, Beirut, Lebanon, 2007), p. 14
- ⁵ . Ghalib, Mustafa "رسائل إخوان الصفا", Vol. 4, (Dar al-Maktaba'h al Hilal, Beirut, Lebanon, 1079) pp. 139-140
- ⁶ . Qazi, Numan, "Asas al Ta'wil", (Dar al Ma'arif, Egypt, 1995), pp. 60-62
- ⁷ . *Amr Bin Abi Amr Shaibani* was a well-known writer and lexicographer of Kufa. Zubaydi has counted him in the third generation of Muslim scholars See for more details. *Al-Suyuti, Jalal al-Din, في بغية الوعاة في طبقات اللغويين والنحاة*, ed. Abu al-Fazl, Ibrahim, Vol. 2, (al-Maktaba al Asri'ah, Saida, Lebanon, 2002), pp. 228-229
- ⁸ . Al-Jahiz, Amr Bin Bahr, *Al-Bayyan wa Al-Tabeen*, ed. Abdul Salam Haroon, vol. 1, (Dar and Maktab al-Hilal, Beirut, Lebanon, 1997), pp-7071
- ⁹ . Al-Jahiz, Amr Bin Bahr, *Kitab al-Hayawan*, vol. 2, (Dar al-Kitab al-Alamiya, Beirut, 1424 AH), pp. 39-40
- ¹⁰ . *Sharistani, Abdel Karim*, "al-milal Wa al-Nihal", Vo. 1, (Dar al Sadir, Beirut, 1999), pp. 190-191
- ¹¹ . Fada'i'h al Batiniyyah, p. 10
- ¹² . al-Baqar'ah: 129
- ¹³ . Tibrani, Sulaiman Bin Ahmad, "al-Mujam al Kabir", ed. Hamdi, Abdel Majid, Vol. 9, (Maktabah Ibn Taymiyyah, Cairo, 1994), pp. 104-105
- ¹⁴ . A'amdi, Ali Bin Ali, "al-Ihkam fi Usul al-Ahkam", ed. Afifi, Abdel Raza'q, Vol. 3, (Dar al A'fa'aq al Jadida'h, Beirut, Lebanon, 1997), pp. 16-17
- ¹⁵ . Baghdadi, Abdel Qahir, "al-Farq bain al Fir'aq", Vol. 1, (Dar al A'afaq al Jadid'ah, Beirut, Lebanon, 1977), pp. 280-281
- ¹⁶ . Shatibi, Ibrahim Bin Musa, " al-Itisam", Vol. 1, (Matba'h al Sa'adah, Cairo, Egypt, 1977) pp. 252-253
- ¹⁷ . Ghalib, Mustafa, "Sinan Rashid Uddin: Shiekh al Jabal al Salis", (Dar al Yaqdah al Arabia, Beirut, 1967), pp. 140-141
- ¹⁸ . Qazi, Numan, " T'awil al Da'ayim", Vol. 1, (Dar al Ma'arif, Cairo, Egypt, 1995) pp. 178- 180
- ¹⁹ . al-Aq'aid al Batiniyya'h, pp. 17-18
- ²⁰ . Hamm'adi, Muhammad Bin Malik, "Kashf al asrar al Batiniyyah wa akhbar al Qaramit'ah", Vol. 3 (Matb'ah Anwar al Uloom, Baghdad, 1357 A.H), pp. 24-25
- ²¹ . Ibid, pp. 75-76
- ²² . Malti, Abdur Rehman, " كتاب التنبيه والرد على أهل الأهواء والبدع ", (Maktab'ah Madbuli, Cairo, Egypt, 1993) pp. 18-19
- ²³ . Kirmani, Ahmed Hamid Uddin, " Rahat al Aql", ed. Mustafa Ghalib, (Dar al Tur'ath al Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon, 1967) pp. 195-198
- ²⁴ . Sajistani, Abu Yaqoob " Isbat al Nubu'aat", ed. Arif Tamir, (Dar Sadir, Beirut, Lebanon, 1982), pp. 110-111
- ²⁵ . Fada'ih al Batinyy'ah. pp. 42-43
- ²⁶ . Ibid, p. 44
- ²⁷ . Razi, Ahmad Bin Hamdan " Ila'am al Nubu'ah" (Anjuman Shaninshahi, Falsafa' Iran, 2018), pp. 18-19

- ²⁸ . Quran 12:21
- ²⁹ . Virani, Shafique. "Hierohistory in Qāḍī l-Nu'mān's Foundation of Symbolic Interpretation (Asās al-Ta'wīl): The Birth of Jesus". Studies in Islamic Historiography. doi:10.1163/978900 4415294_007.
- ³⁰ . Fadai'h al Batiniyyah, pp. 50-51
- ³¹ . Arakon, Muhammad, " Tarikhiyy'ah al Fikr Islami", (Dar al Shuruq, Beirut, Lebanon, 2007), pp. 146-147
- ³² . Ibid. p. 141
- ³³ . Hanafi, Hasan, " al Yasar al Islami wal Wahd'ah al Arabi'ah", Vol. 2 (Dar al Yaqdah al Arabi'ah, Beirut, Lebanon, 2002), pp. 143-144
- ³⁴ . Tizini, Tayyib, In front of the problematic structure and reading of the Qur'anic text """, (Dar al Yanambi, Beirut, 1997), pp. 365-366
- ³⁵ . Abu Zaid, Nasr Hamid " Criticism of religious Discourse", (Maktab'ah Madbuli, Cairo, Egypt, 1995), pp. 94-95
- ³⁶ . Ali, Harb, " Naqd al Nas", p. 25-26, <https://www.noor-book.com/%D9%83%D8%AA%> , Retrieved: 20-06-2021
- ³⁷ . Ibid. p. 21
- ³⁸ . Ibid. p. 83
- ³⁹ . Omairi, Sultan "الاتجاه الباطني في تشكله الجديد", (Mujallah al-Bayan, Vol. 296, KSA), p. 06
- ⁴⁰ . Ibid. pp. 09-10
- ⁴¹ . Arakon, Muhammad, "قضايا في نقد العقل الديني", (Dar al Yaqdah al Arabi'ah, Beirut, 2002), pp. 157-160
- ⁴² . Arakon, Muhammad, "الفكر الأصولي واستحالة التأصيل", (Dar al Yaqdah al Arabi'ah, Beirut, 2002), p. 37
- ⁴³ . Ali, Harb, " Naqd al Nas", p. 87-88, <https://www.noor-book.com/%D9%83%D8%AA%> , Retrieved: 20-06-2021
- ⁴⁴ . Shurfi, Abdel Majid, " Islam between the Revelation and history", (Dar al Shuruq, Beirut, Lebanon, 2016), p. 15-18
- ⁴⁵ . Hanafi, Hasan, " Faith to Revelation", Vol. 1, (Dar al Tanwir li Tiba'ah wal Nashr, Beirut, Lebanon, 1988), pp. 60-61
- ⁴⁶ . Hasan, Hanfi, " Heritage and Revival", (Dar al Nashr, Beirut, Lebanon, 2012), pp. 14-15
- ⁴⁷ . Arakon, Muhammad, " Islamic Thought: An Academic Study", (al Markaz al Saqafi al Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon, 1996), pp. 100-101
- ⁴⁸ . Arakon, Muhammad, " Issues in the Criticism of Religion", (Dar al Maa'rif, Cairo, Egypt, 2015), pp. 279-280
- ⁴⁹ . Al-Feel, Sohail, " al-Nusairyy'ah, pp. 52-53
- ⁵⁰ . Hammadi, Muhammad Bin Malik, " Kashf al Asrar al Batiniyyah", pp. 68-69
- ⁵¹ . Ali Harb, " Naqd al Nass", p. 24
- ⁵² . Abu Zaid, Nasr Hamid " Criticism of religious Discourse", (Maktab'ah Madbuli, Cairo, Egypt, 1995), pp. 190-191
- ⁵³ . Hanafi, Hasan, " Faith to Revelation", Vol. 4, (Dar al Tanwir li Tiba'ah wal Nashr, Beirut, Lebanon, 1988), p. 533
- ⁵⁴ . Ta'an, Ahmed JIdrees " العلماء والقرآن الكريم: تاريخية النص", p. 346, <https://waqfeya.net/book.php>, Retrived: 21-06-2021
- ⁵⁵ .Shurfi, Abdel Majid, " Islam between the Revelation and history", (Dar al Shuruq, Beirut, Lebanon, 2016), p. 70
- ⁵⁶ .Ibid. p. 14

- ⁵⁷ . Tusi, Khawja Nasir Uddin, “Matlub al Mominin”, Trans. Hunzai, Nasir Uddin, (Dar al Hikmah al Ismaili’ah, Hunza, Gilgit, Pakistan, 1980), pp. 17-18
- ⁵⁸ .Al-Baqarah, 45
- ⁵⁹ . Hunzai, Nasir Uddin, "Ya Ali Madad", (Danishgah Khana’ Hikmat, Karachi, Pakistan, 1965), pp. 12-13
- ⁶⁰ . Matuloob al Momineen, pp. 20-21
- ⁶¹ . al-Talaq, 04
- ⁶² . Matloob al Mumineen, p. 20
- ⁶³ . Maryam,26
- ⁶⁴ . Matloob al mumineen, p. 26
- ⁶⁵ . Hunzai, Nasir Uddin, “ Ladder of Knowledge”, (Danishgah Khana’ Hikmat, Karachi, Pakistan, 1965), pp. 60-61
- ⁶⁶ . Matloob al mumineen, p. 21
- ⁶⁷ . Baghdadi, Abdel Qahir, “al-Farq bain al Fir’aq”, Vol. 1, (Dar al A’afaq al Jadid’ah, Beirut, Lebanon, 1977), pp. 280-281
- ⁶⁸ . Alexander D. Knysh. "Sufism and the Qur'an". Brill Encyclopedia of the Qur'an. https://referenceworks.brillonline.com/entries/encyclopaedia-of-the-quran/sufism-and-the-quran-EQCOM_00196#d35639229e80 retrieved: 20-06-2012
- ⁶⁹ . Sufi Tafsir and Isma’ili Ta’wil, <http://www.arches.uga.edu/~godlas/suftaf/suftaftawil.html>, Retrieved; 20-06-2012
- ⁷⁰ . Mahmoud M. A. The Qur'an and its interpreters. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1984) pp. 44-45
- ⁷¹ . Arakon, Muhammad, “ Tarikhiyy’ah al Fikr Islami”, (Dar al Shuruq, Beirut, Lebanon, 2007), pp. 41-50
- ⁷² . Omairi, Sultan”الاتجاه الباطني في تشكله الجديد”, (Mujallah al-Bayan, Vol. 296, KSA), pp. 10-11
- ⁷³ . Tarikhiyy’ah al Fikr Islami, pp. 104-105
- ⁷⁴ . al fikr al Islami, p. 115
- ⁷⁵ . Jabiri, Muhammad Abid, “ Bunya’h al Aql”, (Dar al Yaqda’h al Arabi’ah, Bierut, 2002), pp. 545-546
- ⁷⁶ . This is according to renowned geologist Zaghoul Al-Najjar as he expounded scientific verses on the Sharjah satellite channel during Ramadan in previous years.
- ⁷⁷ . Omairi, Sultan”الاتجاه الباطني في تشكله الجديد”, (Mujallah al-Bayan, Vol. 296, KSA), pp. 13-14